

John J. Duffy (SB No. 6224834)  
Kevin M. Ringel (SB No. 6308106)  
Margaret C. Redshaw (SB No. 6327480)  
**SWANSON, MARTIN & BELL, LLP**  
330 N Wabash, Suite 3300  
Chicago, Illinois 60611  
Tel: (312) 321-9100; Fax: (312) 321-0990  
jduffy@smbtrials.com  
kringel@smbtrials.com  
mredshaw@smbtrials.com

Marc G. Cowden (SB No. 169391)  
Adam Stoddard (SB No. 272691)  
**SHEUERMAN, MARTINI, TABARI,  
ZENERE & GARVIN**  
1033 Willow Street  
San Jose, California 95125  
Tel: (408) 288-9700; Fax: (408) 295-9900  
mcowden@smtlaw.com  
astoddard@smtlaw.com

*Counsel for Defendant Chart Inc.*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA  
SAN FRANCISCO DIVISION**

IN RE PACIFIC FERTILITY CENTER  
LITIGATION

Case No. 3:18-cv-01586-JSC

**DECLARATION KEVIN RINGEL IN  
SUPPORT OF DEFENDANT CHART  
INC.'S MOTION TO EXCLUDE  
ANAND KASBEKAR AND DAVID  
WININGER**

Date: March 4, 2021  
Time: 9:00 a.m.  
Judge: Hon. Jacqueline Scott Corley  
Place: Zoom

1 I, Kevin Ringel, declare as follows:

2 1. I am a partner at the law firm of Swanson, Martin & Bell, LLP, which is counsel  
3 of record for Defendant Chart Inc. I am an attorney admitted to practice in the State of Illinois  
4 and am admitted *pro hac vice* before this Court. I submit this declaration in support of Chart's  
5 Motion to Exclude Plaintiffs' Experts Anand Kasbekar and David Wininger (Motion). I have  
6 personal knowledge of the matters stated herein.

7 2. Attached hereto as **Exhibit A** is a true and correct copy of Anand Kasbekar's  
8 Expert Report dated November 6, 2020.

9 3. Attached hereto as **Exhibit B** is a true and correct copy of Anand Kasbekar's  
10 Rebuttal Report dated December 4, 2020.

11 4. Attached hereto as **Exhibit C** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the  
12 December 13, 2019 deposition of Anand Kasbekar, taken in this action with the court reporter's  
13 signed certification.

14 5. Attached hereto as **Exhibit D** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the  
15 November 25, 2020 deposition of Anand Kasbekar, taken in this action with the court reporter's  
16 signed certification.

17 6. Attached hereto as **Exhibit E** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the  
18 December 15, 2020 deposition of Anand Kasbekar, taken in this action with the court reporter's  
19 signed certification.

20 7. Attached hereto as **Exhibit F** is a true and correct copy of David Wininger's  
21 Expert Report dated November 6, 2020.

22 8. Attached hereto as **Exhibit G** is a true and correct copy of the transcript of the  
23 November 30, 2020 deposition of David Wininger, taken in this action with the court reporter's  
24 signed certification.

25 9. Attached hereto as **Exhibit H** is a true and correct copy of Franklin Miller's  
26 Expert Report dated November 20, 2020.

27 10. Attached hereto as **Exhibit I** is a true and correct copy of Franklin Miller's  
28 Rebuttal Report dated December 11, 2020.

